

Fortran (CD 1539-1)

Disposition of CD Approval Ballot Comments

Dr T M R Ellis
Convenor: SC22/WG5

1. Introduction

A Working Draft for a revision of ISO/IEC 1539:1991(E) was published in May 1995 as SC22/WG5 N1122, and was distributed to SC22 for combined ballots to register it as a Committee Draft (CD) and to approve that CD for further processing as a Draft International Standard (DIS). The ballots concluded on 28th September 1995.

The Registration Ballot received unanimous approval from those countries who voted.

The Approval Ballot also passed, attracting only one negative vote (from the USA). However it also drew a substantial number of ballot comments from some of the countries voting in favour, and WG5 met in San Diego, CA, USA, 6–10 November, 1995 in order to review the comments and to take appropriate action. A very small number of items were left unresolved and were referred to the Primary Development Body (ANSI/X3J3) for resolution. Following X3J3's further processing their recommendations were balloted within WG5. This document reflects both the decisions made during the meeting and the subsequent decisions approved by WG5 ballot.

2. SC22 Ballot Results

The result of the CD registration ballot was:

'P' Member bodies voting in favour without comments	16
'P' Member bodies abstaining	1
'P' Member bodies not voting	7
'O' Member bodies voting in favour without comments	2

The result of the CD approval ballot was:

'P' Member bodies voting in favour without comments	11
'P' Member bodies voting in favour with comments	4
'P' Member bodies voting against approval	1
'P' Member bodies abstaining	1
'P' Member bodies not voting	7
'O' Member bodies voting in favour without comments	2

3. Analysis of Comments

Four member bodies (France, Germany, Japan and UK) submitted comments with their vote in favour of approval of the CD, while USA submitted comments to accompany their negative vote. All comments were aggregated into a single document (SC22/WG5 N1135) which was used as the base document for processing.

The majority of comments were described as “editorial”, while the UK submitted, in addition, a number of “substantive comments” and the USA submitted a large number of “editorial” proposals, a substantial number of “quality improvement” proposals, and a total of 20 “reasons for voting NO”.

In total there were 388 “editorial” comments, 167 “quality improvement” proposals, 22 “substantive comments” from the UK, and 20 “reasons for voting NO” from the USA. All of these were examined by one of four subgroups during the WG5 meeting, and their recommendations brought before the full working group for approval, or otherwise.

All of the 20 US “reasons for voting NO” were either accepted or resolved to the satisfaction of the US delegation in an alternative manner.

19 of the UK’s substantive comments were also satisfactorily resolved, but it was not possible to fully resolve three of them, all of which had significant technical implications, and these were referred to X3J3 for further work. After extensive discussion with members of the UK delegation, X3J3 made proposals at their meeting in February 1996 which were acceptable to the UK and which subsequently were accepted by the membership of WG5 in an (electronic) letter ballot.

All of the editorial and quality improvement proposals were resolved during the meeting, with the vast majority either being accepted or dealt with in an alternative manner. All of the subgroup recommendations were approved by the members of WG5 at the San Diego meeting, and the complete set of edits contained in SC22/WG5 N1153 was approved in Resolution S5 from that meeting.

In view of the very large number of (minor) comments it is not proposed to incorporate a detailed description of the action taken for each one. However, a complete list of all ballot comments, and a complete list of the actions taken on each comment are available from the WG5 ftp server, as described in section 4 of this report.

4. Referenced Documents

SC22/WG5 N1135 Sorted CD Ballot Comments

SC22/WG5 N1153 Approved edits to CD 1539-1

Both documents are available on the WG5's anonymous ftp server at

<ftp.nag.co.uk/sc22wg5>

in the subdirectory N1135-N1172. Each is available in PostScript (.ps), Acrobat (.pdf) and Text (.txt) forms, in the appropriately named subdirectory. Because of their size, all these files are gzip compressed.

T M R Ellis
SC22/WG5 Convenor

4 July 1996