

Fortran (CD 1539-1)

Disposition of CD Approval Ballot Comments

Dr T M R Ellis
Convenor: SC22/WG5

1. Summary

A Working Draft for a revision of ISO/IEC 1539:1991(E) was published in May 1995 as SC22/WG5 N1122, and was distributed to SC22 for combined ballots to register it as a Committee Draft (CD) and to approve that CD for further processing as a Draft International Standard (DIS). The ballots concluded on 28th September 1995.

The Registration Ballot received unanimous approval from those countries who voted.

The Approval Ballot also passed, attracting only one negative vote (from the USA). However it also drew a substantial number of ballot comments from some of the countries voting in favour, and WG5 met in San Diego, CA, USA, 6–10 November, 1995 in order to review the comments and to take appropriate action. A very small number of items were left unresolved and were referred to the Primary Development Body (ANSI/X3J3) for resolution. Following X3J3's further processing their recommendations were balloted within WG5. This document reflects both the decisions made during the meeting and the subsequent decisions approved by WG5 ballot.

2. SC22 Ballot Results

The result of the CD registration ballot was:

'P' Member bodies voting in favour without comments	16
'P' Member bodies abstaining	1
'P' Member bodies not voting	7
'O' Member bodies voting in favour without comments	2

The result of the CD approval ballot was:

'P' Member bodies voting in favour without comments	11
'P' Member bodies voting in favour with comments	4
'P' Member bodies voting against approval	1
'P' Member bodies abstaining	1
'P' Member bodies not voting	7
'O' Member bodies voting in favour without comments	2

3. Analysis of Comments

Four member bodies (France, Germany, Japan and UK) submitted comments with their vote in favour of approval of the CD, while USA submitted comments to accompany their negative vote. All 597 comments were aggregated into a single document (SC22/WG5 N1135) which was used as the base document for processing.

All of these were examined by one of six subgroups during the WG5 meeting, and their recommendations brought before the full working group for approval, or otherwise. The complete set of approved edits (SC22/WG5 N1153) was subsequently endorsed by an electronic ballot of the complete WG5 membership.

3.1 Editorial Comments

France (3), Japan (12), Germany (194), UK (15) and USA (331) submitted editorial comments at several levels, none of which affected the technical content of the document, but which were intended to improve its quality. The majority of these were accepted, or dealt with in an alternative manner (for example, when two countries offered different solutions to the same issue), and the complete set of editorial changes was accepted by all the countries present at the meeting, and by a subsequent ballot of the Working Group membership.

3.2 UK Substantive Comments

In addition to its editorial comments, the UK's YES vote was accompanied by 22 "substantive comments".

19 of these were satisfactorily resolved during the meeting, but it was not possible to fully resolve three of them, all of which had significant technical implications, and these were referred to WG5's Primary Development Body (ANSI/X3J3) for further work. After extensive discussion with members of the UK delegation, X3J3 made proposals at their meeting in February 1996 which were acceptable to the UK and which subsequently were accepted by the membership of WG5 in an (electronic) letter ballot.

3.3 US Negative Ballot Comments

The United States was the only country to vote against approval of the CD, and their vote was accompanied by 176 minor editorial comments, and 155 "quality improvement" editorial comments, together with 20 "reasons for voting NO".

Of these 20 issues, the solution proposed by the USA was accepted in twelve cases, while an alternative solution, acceptable to the US delegation, was agreed for the remaining eight.

All 20 “reasons for voting NO” were thus resolved to the satisfaction of the US member body (and of the other member bodies present in San Diego and/or voting in the subsequent WG5 confirmation ballot).

4. Referenced Documents

SC22/WG5 N1135 Sorted CD Ballot Comments

SC22/WG5 N1153 Approved edits to CD 1539-1

Both documents are available on the WG5’s anonymous ftp server at

`ftp.nag.co.uk/sc22wg5`

in the subdirectory N1135-N1172. Each is available in PostScript (.ps), Acrobat (.pdf) and Text (.txt) forms, in the appropriately named subdirectory. Because of their size, all these files are gzip compressed.

In addition, SC22/WG5 N1167 contains the complete list of changes made to the CD to create the DIS (which incorporates a number of additional minor editorial corrections concerning which WG5 authorised the Editor to use his discretion).

T M R Ellis
SC22/WG5 Convenor

11 July 1996