Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB	2.1	Constraint 407b	ed	Clarification	Change "or the first argument to the intrinsic" to "or as the first argument to any of the intrinsic" and change "or C_LOC" to "and C_LOC".	
GB	2.1	Note 2.1	ed	Give the real reason for constraint 407c, that is: why TYPE(*) explicit-shape arrays are not permitted.	Replace "to construct ... assumed-size." by "passed for an assumed-type explicit-shape array that is an actual argument corresponding to an assumed-shape dummy argument."	
GB	2.4.2	end of subclause	te	There should be a note with an explanation of asynchronous communication and an example illustrating it.		
GB	5.3.3	CFI_type_t type	ed	Table 5.2 specifies what must be provided, not the .h file.	Replace sentence "Macros ... file" by "The macros listed in Table 5.2 provide values that correspond to each specifier."	
GB	5.3.3	CFI_attribute_t attribute	ed	Table 5.1 specifies what must be provided, not the .h file.	Replace sentence "Macros ... file" by "The macros listed in Table 5.1 provide values that correspond to each specifier."	
GB	5.3.5.1	Paragraph 4	ed	Trying to combine the two cases with fewer words does not work.	Replace "The following ... interface" by "The following restrictions apply to an object that is pointed to by a formal parameter that corresponds to a nonpointer dummy argument in a BIND(C) interface or is an actual argument that corresponds to a nonpointer dummy argument in a BIND(C) interface"	
GB	5.3.5.1	Paragraph 4 bullet list	ed	Use the correct Fortran terms	Change "modified" to "defined or become undefined" and "accessed" to "referenced".	
GB	5.3.5.1	Paragraph 5	ed	This paragraph is inconsistent with 5.3.7 paragraph 2, which states the general case.	Delete the entire paragraph "A C descriptor ...on return.".	
GB	5.3.5.1	Paragraph 6	ed	Clarification	Replace sentence "If ... returned." by "A nonzero value is returned if an error condition was detected, and the value zero is returned otherwise."	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB	5.3.5.3	dv	te	"describing the object" is too vague – obviously the base address cannot be provided.	Replace with text specifying precisely which members of dv need to be defined before calling.	
GB	5.3.5.4	dv	te	"the C descriptor is updated" is too vague.	Replace with text specifying precisely which member of the C descriptor will be updated.	
GB	5.3.5.5	Description	ed	If base_addr is a null pointer, no object is involved.	Delete "for an object"	
GB	5.3.5.5	Parameter dv	ed	"appropriate rank" is too vague	Replace "appropriate rank" by "rank specified by {rank}". [Where {} refers to computer font.]	
GB	5.3.5.5	Parameter base_addr	ed	Clarification	Replace "the object" by "the object to be described".	
GB	5.3.5.5	Parameter base_addr	ed	Correct usage	Add comma after second "pointer"	
GB	5.3.5.5	Parameter base_addr	ed	Say how the type is specified.	Replace "specified type" by "type specified by {type}".	
GB	5.3.5.5	Parameter elem_len	ed	There may be no object, but there is always a type.	Replace "the {sizeof()} for an element of the object" by "{sizeof()} for the type" and "object is of" by "type is a".	
GB	5.3.5.5	Parameter elem_len	ed	To simplify and allow for the case with no object	Replace "shall be ... kind" by "shall be the required character length times the {sizeof()} for the type".	
GB	5.3.5.5	Parameter rank	ed	This parameter always provides the rank . There may be no object.	Replace "is the rank of the object" by "specifies the rank".	
GB	5.3.5.6	dv and Result Value	te	Wrong article in the dv paragraph. The result needs to say explicitly what the return value is if the argument does not describe an array.	In the dv paragraph, replace "the" with "an". In the Result Value paragraph, after ""is" insert "scalar or".	
GB	5.3.5.7	Parameter result	ed	Correct usage	Replace "result shall point to" to "result shall be the address of"	
GB	5.3.5.7	Parameter result	ed	"appropriate rank" is too vague. The rank must be that of {source}, minus the number of zero strides.	Replace "of the appropriate rank" by "with rank equal to the rank of {source} minus the number of zero strides".	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB	5.3.5.7	Parameter lower_bounds	ed	A null pointer does not point to anything	Replace "lower_bounds points to" to "lower_bounds shall be a null pointer or the address of"	
GB	5.3.5.7	Parameter upper_bounds	ed	A null pointer does not point to anything	Replace "upper_bounds points to" to "upper_bounds shall be a null pointer or the address of"	
GB	5.3.5.7	Parameter strides	ed	A null pointer does not point to anything	Replace "strides points to" to "strides shall be a null pointer or the address of"	
GB	5.3.5.7	Parameter strides	ed	"element" is ambiguous and "stride" has just been used	Replace "an element is 0" by "a stride is 0".	
GB	5.3.5.7	Paragraph following parameter strides	ed	The parameter name is {strides}.	Change "{stride} elements that have value" to "strides that are".	
GB	5.3.5.7	Example	ed	The {result} C descriptor must be established correctly before CFI_section is invoked. The examples should illustrate this, as is done already in 5.3.5.8.	Replace "updates a C descriptor" to "establishes a C descriptor and updates it". Replace the comment line by "CFI_rank_t rank = 1 ; ind = CFI_establish ((CFI_cdesc_t *) &section, NULL, CFI_attribute_assumed, CFI_type_float, 0, rank, NULL);"	
GB	5.3.5.7	Example	ed	Linking the two examples is confusing. They should be separated.		
GB	5.3.5.8	Parameter result	ed	"appropriate rank" is too vague. The rank must be that of {source}, see source paragraph.	Replace "of the appropriate rank" by "with the same rank as {source}.	
GB	5.3.5.8	Parameter result	ed	It would be much better to give the purpose of {type} here rather than at the end of the paragraph after the elem_len paragraph.	Before "If" add "The {type} member specifies the type of the array section."	
GB	5.3.5.8	Parameter source	ed	The proposed change for "result" makes the sentence "The corresponding ... result." redundant.	Delete "The corresponding ... result.".	

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB	5.3.5.9	Parameter lower_bounds	ed	Correction	Change "rank zero" to "rank is zero".	
GB	5.3.5.9	Paragraph following parameter lower_bounds	ed	To be consistent with the style elsewhere.	Change "in the {lower_bounds} argument" to "in {lower_bounds}".	
GB	5.3.6	Paragraph 2	ed	Use the correct term.	Change "unknown-size" to "assumed-size".	
GB	5.3.7	Paragraph 2	te	A note with a simple example would be helpful.	Add a note.	
GB	5.3.8	Paragraph 3 bullet item (6) (c)	te	A BIND(C) routine should be prohibited from having a CONTIGUOUS POINTER dummy argument	After pointer insert "that does not have the CONTIGUOUS attribute".	
GB	5.3.8		te	The passing of a discontiguous array section from a C routine to a contiguous assumed-shape array dummy argument should be explicitly stated to be permitted.		
GB	5.3.8		te	It should be explicitly stated that a C routine whose Fortran interface has a CONTIGUOUS assumed-shape array dummy must be prepared to handle a discontiguous actual argument itself.		
GB	6.4	Constraint 407b	ed	Clarification	Change "or the first argument to the intrinsic" to "or as the first argument to any of the intrinsic" and change "or C_LOC" to "and C_LOC".	
GB	6.5	Set 2	ed	For consistency with final edit in paragraph 6.9	Change "15.5.4" to "15.6.4" twice.	
GB	6.9	Set 3	ed	The previous edit is to 15.2.3.3.	Change "15.2.3.4" to "15.2.3.3".	
GB	A.1.1		te	The subclause does not specify the two situations clearly and uses terms including "start address" and "available by the language rules" inappropriately.	Replace the subclause.	
GB	A.1.3		te	This example does not seem to add anything relevant to the new features beyond what is in A.1.2. It illustrates the use of a generic interface, a feature introduced in Fortran 90. Also the example is not 64-bit-safe.	Delete the entire subclause.	

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	**Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex** (e.g. 3.1)	**Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note** (e.g. Table 1)	**Type of com-ment[2]**	**Comment (justification for change) by the MB**	**Proposed change by the MB**	**Secretariat observations** on each comment submitted
GB	A.1.4	Paragraph 1	ed	The first sentence is inappropriate.	Replace "Assumed-rank ...assumed-type" by "There are situations where an assumed-rank dummy argument can be useful in Fortran, although a Fortran procedure cannot itself access its value".	
GB	A.1.4	Paragraph 1	ed	It is not the case that "many" of the IEEE intrinsic procedures can make use use this feature.	Change "many of the IEEE intrinsic procedures" to "the IEEE inquiry functions".	
GB	A.1.4	Paragraph 2	ed	The first sentence lacks a verb.	Change "An example ... function" to "The specific procedures for the IEEE_SUPPORT_DIVIDE function might be implemented in Fortran as follows:".	
GB	A.2.1		te	The example of copying a possibly-noncontiguous array to a contiguous buffer is hard to understand and has poor performance.	Delete everything from "The following example" to the end of A.2.1.	
GB	A.2.3 (and contents list)	Title	ed	Correct usage and make clarification	Replace "slice" by "section" and at end, add "using CFI_section"	
GB	A.2.4 (and contents list)	Title	ed	Clarification	Change to "Example of the use of CFI_setpointer".	
GB	Following A.2.4		ge	Amplification. There has been much discussion of the needs of MPI.	Add a subclause illustrating calls to MPI.	

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10